

MINUTES
BLOOMINGTON HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING,
THURSDAY, SEPTEMBER 18, 2014, 5:00 P.M.
COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CITY HALL
109 E. OLIVE ST., BLOOMINGTON, ILLINOIS

MEMBERS PRESENT: Mr. Williams, Mr. Kennedy, Ms. Graehling, Mr. Sturgeon, Mr. Elterich, Mr. Westerhout

MEMBERS ABSENT: Mr. Durham

OTHERS PRESENT: Tom Dabareiner, Community Development Director
Mark Woolard, City Planner

CALL TO ORDER: Chairman Kennedy called the meeting to order at 5:00 P.M.

ROLL CALL: Mr. Woolard called the roll.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None

MINUTES: The commissioners reviewed the minutes from the August 21, 2014 meeting and in the heading on page one, “THRUSDAY” should read “THURSDAY”. On page four, “batons” should read “battens” in both sentences and on page five, “Justice-Pearson” should read “Justus Pearson.” On page two, “Mick William Yates” should read “McWilliams Yates.” Mr. Elterich moved to approve the minutes as corrected. Ms. Graehling seconded the motion, which passed by a vote of 6-0.

REGULAR AGENDA:

Case BHP-23-13. Review of application submitted by Adam & Alison Parla, requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for repairs and painting of a front porch for the two story house, late 1850s, Italianate Style, located at 1215 East Washington Street.

Chairman Kennedy introduced the case. Mr. Woolard passed out a photo with an overlay drawing of the to-scale railing.

Mr. Adam Parla, 1215 E. Washington, stated the top will have rounded rail edges and approximately 4” wide which would be supported with 2 by 4’s. He showed a sample of the decorative 24” balusters and stated the total height would not to exceed 28”. Mr. Parla said he was unable to obtain an original photo of the home to determine if there was a railing, however the rail will add to the beauty and safety. The commission discussed the size and spacing of the spindles. Mr. Parla will pursue a 3” by 3” turned spindle.

Mr. Williams moved to approve Case BHP-23-13 with recommended revisions of 3” by 3” turned spindles, 3” to 4” spacing between the spindles and a 4” or greater upper top rail. The motion was seconded by Mr. Westerhout and passed by a vote of 6-0.

Case BHP-03-14. Review of petition submitted by Adam & Alison Parla requesting an up to \$2,500.00 Eugene D. Funk, Jr. Historic Preservation Grant for repairs and painting of a front porch for the two story house, late 1850s, Italianate Style, located at 1215 East Washington Street.

Chairman Kennedy introduced the case which is a re-review of the originally submitted grant application for mainly painting and minor repairs to the deck surface. Mr. Parla stated he needed to add the addendum as the job itself has been modified to include the railings and the deck. There was discussion on why the commission did not approve the grant in a previous meeting which was mainly to wait until the certificate of appropriateness is approved.

Mr. Westerhout moved to approve Case BHP-03-14. The motion was seconded by Mr. Sturgeon and passed by a vote of 6-0.

Case BHP-32-14. Review of application submitted by Adam & Alison Parla, requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for windows for the two story house, late 1850s, Italianate Style, located at 1215 East Washington Street.

Chairman Kennedy introduced the case. Mr. Woolard stated more information such as estimates for the windows are needed. He said windows throughout the house are proposed for replacement.

Mr. Parla stated his plan is to replace all of the original windows with aluminum clad windows with exception of the front, first floor windows which will be replaced with wood.

Chairman Kennedy stated the current windows are true divided lights and asked if the replacement windows would be simulated or true divided lights. Mr. Westerhout stated they would be simulated divided lights with the interior aluminum clad and the application would be on the outside of the wood. Mr. Williams stated the proposed windows would not be just like the true divided light windows. Mr. Parla stated the problem with the current windows is that they tested positive for lead paint and the children tested high for lead. Then the state said all of the windows and doors need replaced. There was discussion on the true divided light, quality of existing windows, refurbishing the existing windows with storm windows versus replacement of the windows. Mr. Westerhout stated the cost of refurbishing the existing windows versus installing new ones may be similar. Mr. Williams said when 150 year old windows are properly restored, they will last another 150 years. Mr. Williams added the old windows are made with old growth wood which cannot be replaced today as it does not exist. He stated replacement windows can last about 12-15 years and then need replacing again. Mr. Williams stated nationwide 60%-80% of all window replacements are for windows less than ten years old which is a startling statistic. He explained that is why restoring the windows first makes more sense than removing the original windows. Mr. Parla stated the window restoration estimate included removal, stripping, painting and reinstalling was a few hundred dollars less per window than a new replacement, however it did not include unforeseen problems such as replacing broken glass or other repairs which would add to the cost. Chairman Kennedy stated there was research on the energy efficiency pay-back for the new replacement windows which resulted in longer than the

useful life of the new window. There was discussion on new windows, storm windows, insulation, energy efficiency and re-glazing.

Chairman Kennedy stated that since there was not an estimate with the actual contractor proposed work, an actual window photo and window material, there would be no way to make a decision on this case or case BHP-33-14.

Mr. Parla stated since there were lead issues, the city's community development is coordinating the replacement and with winter approaching, there is a need to move on this project. There was discussion on retaining the old growth wood windows, contacting the Justus Pearson window contractor, retaining the old glass, obtaining a bid from a window restoration company, the window grille, strength of the glass and lead paint removal. Mr. Parla stated a new window would provide safety glass for his young children. Mr. Westerhout stated the smaller, true divided light windows are less likely to be broken as they are stronger. Chairman Kennedy said there must have been many children who have passed through the home since the 1850's.

Mr. Elterich stated the appearance is critical and the window type provided would not be the same appearance from the street. Chairman Kennedy stated the first and second floor front facade needs to be the same style of all wood divided lights windows. Mr. Sturgeon encouraged Mr. Parla to consider keeping the original windows.

Chairman Kennedy cited the city's Architectural Review Guidelines regarding repair rather than replacement of historic decorative windows. The replacement of historic windows may be approved under the conditions if the historic window is not decorative or the repair is technically infeasible. He said one important item is to understand why it is technically infeasible to repair. Mr. Westerhout urged the importance of obtaining bids from a restorer for the window restoration and the stripping in order to have accurate information to base decisions. There was discussion on local resources to obtain bids.

Ms. Graehling moved to table Case BHP-32-14 for contractor bids and more information that repairs to the historic windows is technically infeasible. The motion was seconded by Mr. Sturgeon and passed by a vote of 6-0.

Case BHP-33-14 Review of petition submitted by Adam & Alison Parla requesting an up to \$2,500.00 Eugene D. Funk, Jr. Historic Preservation Grant for windows for the two story house, late 1850s, Italianate Style, located at 1215 East Washington Street.

Chairman Kennedy introduced the case where more information is needed as stipulated in the case BHP-32-14.

Ms. Graehling moved to table Case BHP-33-14. The motion was seconded by Mr. Williams and passed by a vote of 6-0.

Case BHP-34-14 Review of application submitted by Tim Maurer requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal and replacement of concrete at the Francis Funk House, Italianate Variation, 1876/1914, located at 319 E. Chestnut in the Franklin

Square National Register Historic District.

Chairman Kennedy introduced the case. Mr. Woolard stated the concrete is replaced with concrete and as stipulated in the standards. Staff supports this project.

Mr. Maurer, 317 E. Chestnut, stated the concrete will be replaced with concrete and is located behind the home.

Mr. Westerhout moved to approve Case BHP-34-14. The motion was seconded by Mr. Sturgeon and passed by a vote of 5-0 with Mr. Williams in abstention.

Case BHP-13-13. Review of modifications to the application submitted by Joe and Ruth Haney requesting an up to \$25,000.00 Harriet Fuller Rust Facade Grant consisting of masonry repairs, windows/doors, exterior lighting and walls, roof and railings for the building located at 407-409 W. Washington Street, in the Downtown Bloomington Historic District.

Chairman Kennedy introduced the case. Mr. Woolard stated there are revisions and new photos that show the changes. He said there was a change with the doors.

Mrs. Ruth Haney stated the original bids included one from Pinnacle Doors. She said when they attempted to order the commercial doors, the company was closed. She stated the commercial grade doors have motors that can withstand high usage demands of residential parking. When Pinnacle Doors reopened under new leadership, they were able to provide a special order, commercial carriage door. Mrs. Haney described a shutter type door on Lee Street to house the garbage containers. She described the projects for the building and many price increases due to increases in materials cost and the discovered tuck pointing needs. She said that they had already exceeded the \$50,000 amount for the grant and are asking the city to consider disbursement of funds for the completed work without including the installed commercial doors.

Mr. Woolard confirmed the numbers are a little different and the \$50,000 threshold had been reached. Chairman Kennedy stated the grant threshold had been attained without including the special ordered garage doors. Mrs. Haney stated the threshold doesn't include the tuck-pointing that was completed. Mr. Woolard stated any change needed to come back to the commission for approval.

Mr. Williams complimented the look of the building improvements.

Mr. Sturgeon moved to approve Case BHP-13-13 with the revision to the originally approved grant, removing the completed garage doors from the requirement in order to disburse grant funds, since the grant threshold had been met. The motion was seconded by Ms. Graehling and passed by a vote of 6-0.

OLD BUSINESS:

Mr. Woolard stated there are grant opportunities available through the Illinois Historic Preservation Agency. He said the options could include education, neighborhood banners and/or an update of the historic preservation plan. There was discussion on signs, banners and types of

public education information needed based on past cases. The list of possible education subjects included windows, doors, wood type, paint, porches, roofs and gutters. There was discussion on the need for the city website to be updated to include education materials and photos of historic districts.

There was discussion on the city councils decision not to pursue the carriage walks issue.

NEW BUSINESS:

There was discussion on the Historic Preservation Heritage Awards which included considering the current owner as well as the previous owner (s) who cared for the property. Possibilities for the award categories included, residential, commercial, major turn-around, most improved, longest family owned and structures outside historic districts.

Mr. Woolard stated there was a staff discussion with Mr. Greg Koos regarding a home at 1206 North Roosevelt which is located within a historic district, however it does not have an S-4 designation and is being considered for demolition due to its poor condition. There was discussion on moving a historic home onto the property as opposed to having a new home or a vacant lot.

Chairman Kennedy requested to add a review of the procedure for the certificate of appropriateness and grant applications for next month's agenda. He said there needs to be discussion regarding homeowners returning for multiple modifications to the original approved applications. The discussion needs to include not allowing incomplete applications to come before the commission.

ADJOURNMENT: Mr. Williams made a motion to adjourn. Mr. Elterich seconded the motion which passed unanimously. The meeting was adjourned at 7:04 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,
Mark Woolard, City Planner

For further information contact:

Mark Woolard, City Planner
Department of Planning and Code Enforcement
115 E. Washington Street
Bloomington, IL 61701
Phone (309) 434-2341 Fax (309) 434-2857
E-mail: mwoolard@cityblm.org