

**MINUTES
BLOOMINGTON HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING
THURSDAY, AUGUST 18, 2016, 5:00 P.M.
COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CITY HALL
109 E. OLIVE ST., BLOOMINGTON, ILLINOIS**

MEMBERS PRESENT: Chairman Williams, Mr. Elterich , Ms. Graehling, Mr. Sturgeon, Ms. Cline

MEMBERS ABSENT: Mr. Cawley, Ms. Bailen

OTHERS PRESENT: Ms. Katie Simpson, City Planner
Mr. Tom Dabareiner, Community Development Director

CALL TO ORDER: Chairman Williams called the meeting to order at 5:04 P.M.

ROLL CALL: Ms. Simpson called the roll and with five members present there was a quorum.

PUBLIC COMMENT: No public comment.

MINUTES: The Commission reviewed the minutes from the July 16, 2016 meeting. Ms. Graehling asked for a correct reference to her name on several of the pages. There being no further changes, Ms. Graehling moved for approval of the minutes as amended; seconded by Mr. Elterich. The motion was **approved** by a vote of 5-0 with the following votes cast in favor on roll call: Ms. Graehling—yes; Ms. Cline—yes; Mr. Elterich—yes; Mr. Sturgeon—yes; Chairman Williams—yes.

REGULAR AGENDA:

BHP-21-16. Consideration, review and approval of the application submitted by Mark G. Haggerty requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to add an exterior staircase to the 3rd floor deck at rear of house for the Madison P. Carlock House located at 1001 E Jefferson Street, c.1894-1898, Queen Anne Form; Architect Arthur L. Pillsbury. *Tabled from July 21, 2016 Meeting.

Chairman Williams introduced the case and stated that the case was tabled from the last meeting and the petitioner has withdrawn the petition.

BHP-23-16 Consideration, review and approval of the application submitted by Jim White requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the carriage steps and horse hitches for the property located at 1215 E Washington Street, c.1857, Italianate Style Architecture.

Chairman Williams introduced the case. Ms. Simpson provided the staff report. She stated staff is recommending in favor of the Certificate of Appropriateness, as well as for the Funk Grant request in the related subsequent case. She described the zoning, lot size and other attributes of

the house and the neighboring properties. Ms. Simpson continued that the concrete will be given an aged appearance and efforts will be made to protect the hitching posts from damage. Mr. Elterich asked what kind of stone is currently in place; Chairman Williams reported it was concrete so this new work is replacing concrete that has previously replaced stone, probably around 1905. Ms. Cline asked the status of the proposed work since it is entirely in street right of way; Ms. Simpson replied they will need to get a permit from Public Works.

Chairman Williams expressed some concern about the aged concrete and its ability to look like limestone; Mr. Sturgeon shared this concern. Ms. Cline stated that treating the concrete with acid makes it slightly yellow so it looks aged. Chairman Williams asked if the petitioner was invited to attend the meeting; Ms. Simpson confirmed. Ms. Cline asked if the concern is the need to match limestone; Chairman Williams stated he looked at it and it is not limestone. Ms. Cline suggested they be required to work to match the concrete.

Mr. Sturgeon asked about tabling the grant portion of this work until the Commissioners can see a photo or example of the proposed work; Mr. Elterich supported this idea. Ms. Cline concurred. Chairman Williams stated that the property owner will do a good job.

Mr. Sturgeon motioned to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for Case BHP-23-16; seconded by Ms. Cline. The motion was **approved** by a vote of 5-0 with the following votes cast in favor on roll call: Mr. Sturgeon—yes; Ms. Cline—yes; Ms. Graehling—yes; Mr. Elterich—yes; Chairman Williams—yes.

BHP-24-16 Consideration, review and approval of the application submitted by Jim White requesting a Funk Grant for \$1,750.00 to replace the carriage steps and horse hitches for the property located at 1215 E Washington Street, c.1857, Italianate Style Architecture.

Chairman Williams introduced the case and entertained a motion to table. Ms. Cline motioned to table consideration of the Funk Grant case until a photo of a proposed aged concrete can be provided and approved; seconded by Ms. Graehling. The motion to table was **approved** by a vote of 5-0 with the following votes cast in favor on roll call: Ms. Cline—yes; Ms. Graehling—yes; Mr. Sturgeon—yes; Mr. Elterich—yes; Chairman Williams—yes.

BHP-25-16 Consideration, review and adoption of a recommendation by resolution for the nomination submitted by Dr. Lea Kimberly Cline requesting that the property located at 931 W MacArthur Ave, c. 1907, *Illinois Workman's Cottage (variant)*, receive a historic designation and be rezoned to have the S-4 Historic Preservation District Zoning Overlay. Planning Commission: 9/14/2016 (submission deadline 8.23.16) City Council: 10/10/2016.

Chairman Williams introduced the case. Ms. Cline recused herself and left the chambers. Ms. Simpson stated that staff supports the proposal to add the S-4 overlay zoning to the petitioner's property. She noted the house was built around 1907 and described the area as a potential target area for historic preservation from the City's plan. The property was platted in 1896. She reviewed the architectural features of the house and the unique elements of the Illinois workman's cottage style. Ms. Simpson reviewed the zoning standards associated with adding the S-4 designation. She mentioned this property meets the standards related to heritage and culture,

its role in Bloomington's history, and that it is a good example of this style house built in the period. The house maintains many of the original elements, she stated.

Mr. Sturgeon stated he is pleased with the expansion of the S-4 designation into the west side of Bloomington and he would like to see more of it. Chairman Williams concurred and stated that there are many homes with preservation potential on the west side.

Mr. Sturgeon motioned to approve recommendation for an S-4 overlay on the property; seconded by Mr. Elterich. The motion was **approved** by a vote of 4-0 with the following votes cast in favor on roll call: Mr. Sturgeon—yes; Mr. Elterich—yes; Ms. Graehling—yes; Chairman Williams—yes.

Ms. Cline returned to the chambers.

BHP-26-16 Consideration, review and adoption of a recommendation by resolution for the nomination submitted by Rebecca Spears requesting that the property located at 901 W MacArthur Ave, c. 1888, *Victorian*, Contractor: Frederick Garling, receive a historic designation and be rezoned to have the S-4 Historic Preservation District Zoning Overlay. Planning Commission: 9/14/2016 (submission deadline 8.23.16) City Council: 10/10/2016

Chairman Williams introduced the case. Ms. Simpson presented the staff report with a positive recommendation to add the S-4 overlay to the petitioner's property. She stated the property had several prior street names and was built around 1888. It is surrounded by single family zoning and mixed residential zoning, she stated. The builder had built many local residences, she added. Ms. Simpson noted that the house is a corner lot and directionally accommodates the corner. She reviewed the many architectural characteristics of the house. She referred to the zoning standards again, and noted that this house meets several including the builder's contribution to the community, that he was a local builder, and contains many unique and period design elements.

Matthew Spears, 901 W. MacArthur, credited his wife with completing the petition. He stated that the house has been recognized for its contributing character and that he put a lot of work into preserving the house. Ms. Cline asked if the original siding was redwood; Mr. Spears confirmed it is. He stated the north side of the house was maintained in a piecemeal fashion but the rest of the structure has seen minimal changes.

Mr. Sturgeon motioned to approve recommendation for an S-4 overlay on the property; seconded by Mr. Elterich. The motion was **approved** by a vote of 4-0 with the following votes cast in favor on roll call: Mr. Sturgeon—yes; Mr. Elterich—yes; Ms. Cline—yes; Ms. Graehling—yes; Chairman Williams—yes.

BHP-27-16 Consideration, review and adoption of a recommendation by resolution for the nomination submitted by Dean Carlson and Danell Dvorak requesting that the property located at 913 W MacArthur Ave, c. 1907, *American four-square*, receive historic designation and be rezoned to have the S-4 Historic Preservation District Zoning Overlay. Planning Commission: 9/14/2016 (submission deadline 8.23.16) City Council: 10/10/2016.

Chairman Williams introduced the case. Ms. Simpson presented the staff report with a positive recommendation to add the S-4 overlay to the petitioner's property. She provided background on

the property, the base zoning which is R-1C, noted it platted in 1896, and described some of the unique architectural features of the house. The house retains a lot of original features, she added. She stated that the detached garage carried over some the historical features, but is itself not historic. In reviewing the standards for the zoning request, Ms. Simpson stated that it fits the historical and cultural category, noting in particular the original siding and other original features; it is a good example of the construction style of the area and period.

Danell Dvorak, 913 West MacArthur, spoke on behalf of the petition. She stated that ignoring a lot of bad advice has helped to maintain this house, adding that the dining room windows are original. A few commissioners provided encouraging advice and mentioned what they liked about the house. There was discussion on the need for a railing and how to achieve it, while preserving the columns.

Mr. Sturgeon motioned to approve recommendation for an S-4 overlay on the property; seconded by Mr. Elterich. The motion was **approved** by a vote of 4-0 with the following votes cast in favor on roll call: Mr. Sturgeon—yes; Mr. Elterich—yes; Ms. Cline—yes; Ms. Graehling—yes; Chairman Williams—yes.

Chairman Williams noted that this recommendation will go to the Planning Commission on September 12. Ms. Simpson described the next steps to make the September 12 Planning Commission meeting, then the cases will proceed to the City Council about one month later.

OLD BUSINESS:

Heritage Awards Update—Accepting Nominations. Final decisions to be announced at September Meeting.

Chairman Williams asked if we received any applications and noted that we used to not do this every year. Ms. Simpson stated that the deadline is August 30 and discussed options on how to proceed. It was agreed to wait until the September meeting to consider options.

Optional Historic Preservation Training on September 13, 2016 from 12-2:30 at Normal Town Council Chambers.

Chairman Williams described the training briefly. Ms. Simpson stated it is open to the public and asked if members were going to coordinate through her.

NEW BUSINESS:

Mr. Sturgeon announced he was staying on the Historic Preservation Commission, instead of moving to another commission. There was general discussion about term limits.

ADJOURNMENT: Ms. Graehling made a motion to adjourn; Ms. Cline seconded the motion, which passed unanimously. The meeting adjourned at 6:07PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Tom Dabareiner AICP
Community Development Director