MINUTES
PUBLISHED BY THE AUTHORITY OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION OF BLOOMINGTON, ILLINOIS
REGULAR MEETING
COUNCIL CHAMBERS
109 EAST OLIVE STREET
BLOOMINGTON, IL
THURSDAY, MAY 20, 2021 5:00 P.M.
THIS MEETING WAS HELD VIRTUALLY. LIVE STREAM AVAILABLE AT:
www.cityblm.org/live

Prior to 15 minutes before the start of the meeting, 1) those persons wishing to provide public comment or testify at the meeting registered at www.cityblm.org/register, and/or 2) those persons wishing to provide written comment emailed their comments to publiccomment@cityblm.org.

Members of the public could also attend the meeting at City Hall. Attendance was limited to 10 people including staff and Board/Commission members and required compliance with City Hall COVID-19 protocols and social distancing. Participants and attendees were encouraged to attend remotely.

The Planning Commission convened in Regular Session virtually via Zoom conferencing with City Planner Katie Simpson, Assistant Director Kimberly Smith, and Vice Chair Greg Koos attending in-person in City Hall's Council Chambers at 5:13 p.m., Thursday, May 20, 2021.

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Scharnett and livestreamed to the public at www.cityblm.org/live.

ROLL CALL

Attendee Name	Title	Status
Mr. Paul Scharnett	Chair	Present
Mr. Bobby Castillo	Commissioner	Absent
Ms. Georgene Chissell	Commissioner	Present
Ms. Sherry Graehling	Commissioner	Joined at 5:52
Mr. Greg Koos	Commissioner	Present
Ms. Dawn Peters	Commissioner	Present
Mr. George Boyle	Assistant Corporate Counsel	Absent
Ms. Kimberly Smith	Economic & Community Development Assistant Director	Present
Ms. Katie Simpson	City Planner	Present
Ms. Caitlin Kelly	Assistant City Planner	Present

COVID-19
This meeting was held virtually via live stream pursuant to the gubernatorial executive order 2021-06. Public comment was accepted up until 15 minutes before the start of the meeting.

PUBLIC COMMENT

No public comment.

MINUTES

The Commission reviewed the minutes of the April 15, 2021 regular Historic Preservation Meeting meeting. Mr. Koos motioned to accept the minutes as presented. Ms. Chissell seconded. Roll call vote: Mr. Koos – Yes, Ms. Chissell – Yes, Ms. Peters – Yes, Chairperson Scharnett - Yes. The motion was approved. (4-0-0)

REGULAR AGENDA

A. BHP-07-21 Consideration, review, and action on a petition submitted by Julie Dawson for a Certificate of Appropriateness for roof replacement and chimney repairs, for the property located at 806 N Evans Street (21-04-210-008),Queen Anne style frame building with East Lake and Anglo-Japanese detailing, Robert Greenlee house, c.1884. (Ward 4)

Ms. Kelly introduced the case, explaining staff's positive recommendation of the requested Certificate of Appropriateness. She indicated that the roof and chimney were in need of repair, and that the applicant was unable to find diamond-shaped shingles like those resembling the existing shingles.

Julie Dawson, the applicant, was sworn in for testimony. She spoke to the damage incurred to the roof and chimney and the urgency of the project.

Chairperson Scharnett confirmed that Ms. Dawson was unable to find diamond-shaped shingle manufacturers. She affirmed this. He asked whether the reroofing would occur on both the upper and lower roof. She said yes.

Chairperson Scharnett asked how the contractor plans to handle the flashing, indicating that it may be difficult to obtain traditional detailing. Ms. Dawson said she was unsure how the contractor intends to handle it, but that he has extensive experience working with historic homes.

Chairperson Scharnett asked whether Ms. Dawson planned to replace the roof deck. Ms. Dawson said it would depend on the state of the deck. Chairperson Scharnett expressed concern about the malleability of modern decking materials.

Mr. Koos asked if Ms. Dawson had looked to see how the roof terminates, as it seemed the diamond-shaped shingles had been laid over a built-in gutter system. Ms. Dawson said the contractor had not looked into it, but that he and the insurance adjuster believe there are additional layers of asphalt underneath.

Mr. Koos stated that the replacement shingles are intended to mimic wood shingles rather than slate, which the National Register lists as the original roofing material. Mr. Koos asked whether Ms. Dawson would consider faux slate; she replied that the faux slate shingles she had researched were cost prohibitive and had poor reviews, but that she would be amenable to faux slate shingles made of asphalt.

Ms. Chissell asked Mr. Koos for clarification on the basis of his objection. Mr. Koos said he would approve the project, but not approve City funding unless the shingles were intended to mimic slate. Ms. Chissell asked whether Ms. Dawson would be willing to use imitation slate shingles. Ms. Dawson said she would be willing to look into it, but not if it costs more than the proposed shingles.

Chairperson Scharnett asked the Commission whether they would prefer that a shingle mimicking slate be used. Mr. Koos and Ms. Chissell agreed. Chairperson Scharnett indicated that Atlas makes a fiberglass shingle imitating the look of slate that could be used instead.

Mr. Koos brought up the question of whether a gutter system exists under the roof. Chairperson Scharnett and Ms. Chissell stated they believe it unlikely. Mr. Koos said if there is a gutter system, Ms. Dawson can expect a substantial increase in the cost of the project. Ms. Peters clarified that the Commission is not asking that Ms. Dawson repair the box gutters. Mr. Koos said he did not expect this.

Ms. Peters motioned to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness with the condition that the asphalt shingles resemble be of the appropriate size and shape to resemble slate. Ms. Chissell seconded. Mr. Koos – Yes, Ms. Chissell – Yes, Ms. Peters – Yes, Chairperson Scharnett - Yes. The motion was approved. (4-0-0)

B. BHP-08-21 Consideration, review, and action on a petition submitted by Julie Dawson for a Funk Grant in the amount of $5,000.00 for roof replacement and chimney repairs, for the property located at 806 N Evans Street (21-04-210-008),Queen Anne style frame building with East Lake and Anglo-Japanese detailing, Robert Greenlee house, c.1884. (Ward 4)

Ms. Kelly presented staff's recommendation that the Funk Grant be awarded. Ms. Dawson asked for clarification as to whether the condition that the replacement shingles mimic slate applies to the Certificate of Appropriateness or to the Funk Grant. Chairperson Scharnett confirmed this.

Chairperson Scharnett clarified Ms. Dawson's objection to the suggested material. Ms. Dawson stated it appears too uniform to resemble authentic slate. Chairperson Scharnett suggested other materials. The Commission decided to revisit the case at the end of the meeting in order to give Ms. Dawson the opportunity to research other options in the meantime.

Ms. Chissell motioned to approve the Funk Grant. Ms. Peters seconded. Ms. Peters – Yes, Ms. Chissell – Yes, Ms. Graehling – Yes, Mr. Koos – Yes, Chairperson Scharnett - Yes. The motion was approved. (5-0-0)

C. BHP-09-21 Consideration, review and action on a petition submitted by Brad Williams for a Funk Grant in the amount of $1,837.71 for roof replacement and repairs, for the property located at 702 E Grove St (PIN: 21-04-436-007), East Grove Street District, Queen Anne Variant, Augustus Elbe House, c. 1882 (NC) (Ward 1).

Ms. Kelly presented staff's recommendation that the Funk Grant be approved. She noted that although the Certificate of Appropriateness was awarded for this property in the previous fiscal year, the application was received in that same year.

Mr. Koos motioned to approve the Funk Grant. Ms. Graehling seconded. Ms. Peters – Yes, Ms. Chissell – Yes, Ms. Graehling – Yes, Mr. Koos – Yes, Chairperson Scharnett - Yes. The motion was approved. (5-0-0)

D. BHP-10-21 Consideration, review and action on a petition submitted by Anthony Seckler for a Certificate of Appropriateness for tuckpointing, for the property located at 905 E Jefferson St (PIN: 21-03-303-003), Davis-Jefferson District, Queen Anne form, Edmond O'Connell House, c. 1893-95 (Ward 4).

Ms. Kelly presented the staff report and a tentative recommendation in favor of granting the Certificate of Appropriateness depending on the appropriateness of the proposed acid wash.

Anthony Seckler, the applicant, was sworn in for testimony. He stated that the same kind of brick would be used for the few bricks that are missing.

Chairperson Scharnett asked what kind of mortar would be used. Mr. Seckler stated it would match what is currently present on the foundation. Chairperson Scharnett asked about the form of joints; Mr. Seckler was unsure. Chairperson Scharnett asked what concentration of acid is proposed for the wash. Mr. Seckler was unsure. Chairperson Scharnett expressed concerns with the proposal that the mason would likely need to address. Ms. Chissell and Ms. Graehling agreed with Chairperson Scharnett.

Chairperson Scharnett suggested tabling the case to the next meeting in order to gain more information about the proposal. Ms. Graehling motioned to table BHP-10-21 and BHP-11-21 to the next meeting. Ms. Peters seconded. Ms. Peters – Yes, Ms. Chissell – Yes, Ms. Graehling – Yes, Mr. Koos – Yes, Chairperson Scharnett - Yes. The motion was approved. (5-0-0)

E. BHP-11-21 Consideration, review and action on a petition submitted by Anthony Seckler for a Funk Grant in the amount of $925.00 for tuckpointing for the property located at 905 E Jefferson St (PIN: 21-03-303-003), Davis-Jefferson District, Queen Anne form, Edmond O'Connell House, c. 1893-95 (Ward 4).

This item was tabled to the June 17th meeting.

F. BHP-12-21 Consideration, review and action on a petition submitted by Ruth and Joe Haney for a Rust Grant in the amount of $36,250.00 for roof repairs and replacement, for the property located at 408 W Washington St, former Rust Tractor Site, currently Regional Alternative School, c. 1996, Architect: Paul Young. (NC) (PIN: 21-04-311-006), (Ward 6).

Ms. Simpson presented staff's recommended approval of the Rust Grant up to $25,000 because the building is not considered a contributing structure to the Downtown Historic District.

Ruth and Joe Haney, the applicants, were sworn in for testimony. Mr. Haney spoke to the longstanding problems with the roof and their attempts at maintaining it. Ms. Haney mentioned the urgency of the replacement.

Chairperson Scharnett inquired as to the two quotes provided and asked whether a ridged roof was necessary. Mr. Haney stated that the attic is vented. Both applicants stated that the cost is likely to increase with time as the price of steel is going up.

Mr. Koos asked about the state of the budget. Ms. Simpson stated it is at full capacity. Chairperson Scharnett stated that this as well as the occupancy of the property and the service it provides should be considerations.

Mr. Koos motioned to award a Rust Grant in the amount of $31,250. Ms. Chissell seconded. Ms. Peters – Yes, Ms. Chissell – Yes, Ms. Graehling – Yes, Mr. Koos – Yes, Chairperson Scharnett - Yes. The motion was approved. (5-0-0)

H. BHP-14-21 Consideration, review and action on a petition submitted by Kyle Glandon for a Rust Grant in the amount of $25,000 for window and door replacement to storefront façade, for the property located at 236 E Front St (PIN: 21-04-409-012), National Register Central Business District, Williams Horse Hospital, c. 1883 (C) (Ward 6).

Ms. Simpson presented staff's recommended approval of the requested Rust Grant up to $25,000. The structure is considered contributing to the Downtown Historic District, but staff is uncertain whether the windows are original to the structure.

Chairperson Scharnett recused himself from the discussion due to professional courtesy. Mr. Koos commented that the storefront windows do have historic significance, contrary to staff's report.

Kyle Glandon, the applicant, was sworn in for testimony. He explained that the proposed window system is not original to the building, but would be considered an improvement to the streetscape. He stated his uncertainty as to whether the storefront window systems are original to the building, or when they were installed.

Mr. Koos asked whether any of the other window systems had been replaced. Mr. Glandon stated that they had been removed prior to his ownership of the building. Mr. Koos stated his concern that the existing window system in question is original to the building, and that he believes a better solution to proposed accessibility improvements is possible. Ms. Chissell expressed doubt that the window system is original to the structure.

Mr. Koos stated his opposition to providing funding for the project as proposed because it isn't historic in nature nor does it attempt to emulate a historic feature. He expressed a desire for additional research before voting on the item and raised the possibility of tabling the item to the next meeting. Mr. Glandon stated that the application may be withdrawn if tabled to the next meeting due to time constraints.
Ms. Smith added that part of the purpose of the Rust Grant is to preserve the economic viability of historic structures.

Ms. Chissell asked whether it would be possible to improve the window system and preserve the historic integrity of the structure. Ms. Graehling said it was her understanding that Mr. Koos is advocating for bifold windows, a point on which she agrees. Mr. Glandon stated this mechanically would not be possible.

Mr. Koos asserted that whether or not the window system is original to the building needs to be established before a vote can be reached. Ms. Simpson pointed out that the original building was a horse hospital and asked whether the windows would have been retained from that time. Mr. Koos was unsure.

Ms. Smith pointed out that the historic review criteria discourages the recreation of a building's earlier historical appearance. Mr. Koos argued that he is advocating for research into the building's earlier appearance, rather than a recreation of that appearance.

Mr. Koos and Ms. Graehling stated they would oppose the proposal as presented. Chairperson Scharnett pointed out that a quorum would not necessarily be reached because of his recusal. Ms. Peters suggested tabling the item to the next meeting.

Ms. Peters motioned to table the item to the June 17th meeting. She asked Mr. Glandon whether any part of the project would be actionable in the meantime, or whether he would prefer to table the entirety of the proposal. Mr. Glandon stated his amenability to tabling the item. Ms. Chissell seconded Ms. Peters' motion. Ms. Peters – Yes, Ms. Chissell – Yes, Ms. Graehling – Yes, Mr. Koos – Yes. The motion was approved. (4-0-0)

I. BHP-15-21 Consideration, review and action on a petition submitted by Sherri Masters for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new rear driveway and parking pad, for the property located at 905 N McLean Street (PIN: 21-04-409-012), Franklin Square District, Franklin Baker House, Queen-Anne Style with Georgian Revival Influence c. 1894 (C) (Ward 4).

Ms. Simpson summarized the case and provided staff's recommendation that the Certificate of Appropriateness be approved. She stated that the Certificate is necessary because a building permit is needed before the driveway can be constructed.

Chairperson Scharnett stated that he was unaware driveways would fall under the purview of the Commission. Ms. Simpson explained that the case is the result of a technicality. Chairperson Scharnett suggested that future, similar cases be approved administratively, or that the requirements be revised.

Mr. Koos motioned to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness. Ms. Peters seconded. Ms. Peters – Yes, Ms. Chissell – Yes, Ms. Graehling – Yes, Mr. Koos – Yes, Chairperson Scharnett - Yes. The motion was approved. (5-0-0)

OLD BUSINESS

A. Update on National Preservation Month Activities

An update on the banners and Farmer's Market event was provided. Ms. Graehling pointed out that the information on the 2020 Heritage Award winners had not yet been posted online, and requested that the page be created as soon as possible.

NEW BUSINESS

No items.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 7:53.