MINUTES
BLOOMINGTON HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING
THURSDAY, MAY 19, 2016, 5:00 P.M.
COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CITY HALL
109 E. OLIVE ST., BLOOMINGTON, ILLINOIS

MEMBERS PRESENT: Chairman Williams, Ms. Graehling, Mr. Elterich, Ms. Bailen, Mr. Sturgeon , Ms. Cline.

MEMBERS ABSENT: Mr. Cawley

OTHERS PRESENT: Ms. Katie Simpson, City Planner
Mr. Tom Dabareiner, Community Development Director

CALL TO ORDER: Chairman Williams called the meeting to order at 5:04 P.M.

ROLL CALL: Ms. Simpson called the roll and with six members present there was a quorum.

PUBLIC COMMENT: No public comment.

MINUTES: The Commission reviewed the minutes from the April 21, 2016 meeting. Mr. Elterich moved for approval of the minutes; seconded by Ms. Bailen. The motion was **approved** by a vote of 6-0 with the following votes cast in favor on roll call: Mr. Elterich—yes; Ms. Graehling—yes; Ms. Bailen—yes; Mr. Sturgeon —yes; Ms. Cline—yes; Chairman Williams—yes.

REGULAR AGENDA:

BHP-07-16. Consideration, review and approval of the application submitted by Linda Girard requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for repairing and replacing the detached garage roof to the Daniel M. Davidson property located at 402 E Walnut, c. 1913, Corn Belt Cube.

Chairman Williams introduced the case. Ms. Simpson presented the staff report, stating staff recommends in favor of the COA. She stated the request relates to repair and replacement of a garage roof, which is visible from the street. She stated asphalt shingles would be used to replace existing shingles.

Ms. Graehling clarified that this was the garage associated with the item from the Commission's April meeting. She believes this is a later addition to the property but agrees it is visible from the street.

Mr. Sturgeon moved for approval of Case BHP-07-16; seconded by Mr. Elterich. The motion was **approved** by a vote of 6-0 with the following votes cast in favor on roll call: Mr.

Sturgeon—yes; Mr. Elterich—yes; Ms. Cline—yes; Ms. Graehling—yes; Ms. Bailen—yes; Chairman Williams—yes.

BHP-08-16. Consideration, review and approval of the application submitted by Green Building, LLC requesting a Rust Grant for $17,295.00 for masonry repairs, windows/doors, exterior lighting and painting to the commercial structure (noncontributing) located at 111-113 E Monroe, c.1900.

Chairman Williams introduced the case. Ms. Simpson presented the staff report. She recommended in favor of the grant, but with conditions. She stated this is a noncontributing structure located next to a contributing structure. She indicated a concern with the awnings, which did not appear in an early photo of the structure. She also asked that lighting be directed downward and placed in a location that would not affect the neighboring contributing structure.

Ms, Graehling noted the amount of the grant request was not itemized, but it includes the awnings, and suggested that the grant amount be adjusted downwards based on the cost of the awnings.

Bob Vericella, 125 S. Belmont, was sworn in. Chairman Williams asked for an itemized list of the costs. Mr. Vericella stated he did not have one, but asked for approval contingent on providing an itemized list as he is trying to complete the work prior to a tenant move-in. Ms. Cline also asked for the lighting related costs and the awning expenses. Mr. Sturgeon suggested the Commission might approve the concept and finalize the grant amount next month. Ms. Graehling concurred, stating that she would be fine with approving the request at half the amount after the cost of the awnings is removed from the total project expenses.

Chairman Williams returned to the question about the lighting. He confirmed whether the sconces would look like those in the proposal; Mr. Vericella stated yes, unless he can find something more historic. Ms. Cline suggested the lighting was not original so she would not be supportive of paying for the lighting, so both the awning and lighting costs should come out. Ms. Graehling supports the lighting for safety concerns given the use of the building; Mr. Sturgeon concurred if the lights were period in character. Ms. Cline clarified that the lighting could be included if they are a more historic design. Ms. Simpson stated her concerns were more the impact of the lighting on the neighbors. Mr. Elterich noted they will point down.

Mr. Vericella asked if another light fixture would be acceptable. Mr. Elterich stated he does not have a problem with the fixture as the structure is not contributing, but it is an improvement. There was general discussion about the building's role in Bloomington history and its former uses.

Ms. Cline moved for approval of Case BHP-08-16 for a Rust grant for half the expenses, less the cost of the awnings; seconded by Mr. Sturgeon. The motion was **approved** by a vote of 6-0 with the following votes cast in favor on roll call: Ms. Cline—yes; Mr. Sturgeon—yes; Mr. Elterich—yes; Ms. Graehling—yes; Ms. Bailen—yes; Chairman Williams—yes.

BHP-09-16. Consideration, review and approval of the application submitted by Douglas B. Johnson requesting a Rust Grant for $25,000.00 for masonry repairs and painting to the commercial structure (contributing) located at 115 W. Front, c.1865.

Chairman Williams introduced the case. Ms. Simpson presented that staff report and stated support with the condition that no money is used to pay for non-authentic or synthetic materials. She noted the property is contributing. She stated the petitioner provided two options, one for brick and one for stucco. Of the two options, staff recommends the stucco proposal, she stated. Mr. Elterich clarified that the two proposals are exclusive of each other; Ms. Simpson confirmed it is one or the other.

Douglas Johnson , 3011 Geranium Drive, was sworn in. Mr. Johnson provided some historic background regarding the building. He stated, they take great pride in the building and the stucco has become quite damaged. Mr. Elterich confirmed that the original building was brick. Ms. Cline noted that the stucco went on the building quite early in its history. Mr. Johnson stated that repairs occurred to the bottom half of the building already and his request is focused on the second story. Mr. Johnson confirmed that his request is for one or the other of the options.

Mr. Sturgeon moved for approval of Case BHP-09-16 provided it is for the stucco version; seconded by Ms. Cline. The motion was **approved** by a vote of 6-0 with the following votes cast in favor on roll call: Mr. Sturgeon—yes; Ms. Cline—yes; Mr. Elterich—yes; Ms. Graehling—yes; Ms. Bailen—yes; Chairman Williams—yes.

BHP-10-16. Consideration, review and approval of the application submitted by Sara Simpson and Darcy Ackley requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for painting to the garage and house at the Eliel Barber House located at 709 E Taylor, c.1855, Vertical Plank.

Chairman Williams introduced the case. Ms. Simpson stated that staff supports both the request for the COA and the request for the Funk Grant in case BHP-11-16 for the same address. She noted that if the grant is approved it could not be used again for painting for another ten years. Chairman Williams noted this is a one-of-a-kind structure in the City. Ms. Simpson supports the painting given the condition.

Ms. Cline asked if the garage is historical. Chairman Williams stated it was built later and designed to match the house design. She asked if the Commission is able to fund painting of the garage, as it is a factor in the next case. Ms. Graehling suggested excluding the costs associated with the garage. Mr. Elterich suggested apportioning the award based on labor costs, which is in the estimate. Ms. Cline suggested that the final number needs to be determined, but the Commission might approve it contingent on a revised estimate; Ms. Graehling concurred.

Mr. Sturgeon moved for approval of Case BHP-10-16; seconded by Ms. Cline. The motion was **approved** by a vote of 6-0 with the following votes cast in favor on roll call: Mr. Sturgeon—yes; Ms. Cline—yes; Mr. Elterich—yes; Ms. Graehling—yes; Ms. Bailen—yes; Chairman Williams—yes.

BHP-11-16. Consideration, review and approval of the application submitted by Sara Simpson and Darcy Ackley requesting a Funk Grant for $2500.00 for painting to the garage and house at the Eliel Barber House located at 709 E Taylor, c.1855, Vertical Plank

Chairman Williams introduced the case, noting it is the grant for the COA just approved.

Mr. Sturgeon moved for approval of Case BHP-11-16 up to $2,500 with the garage expenses deleted from the grant; seconded by Ms. Cline. The motion was **approved** by a vote of 6-0 with the following votes cast in favor on roll call: Mr. Sturgeon—yes; Ms. Cline—yes; Mr. Elterich—yes; Ms. Graehling—yes; Ms. Bailen—yes; Chairman Williams—yes.

BHP-12-16. Consideration, review and approval of the application submitted by Mark L Kramp requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to repair the water damaged garden shed for the Alvin B. Hoblit House located at 315 E Chestnut, c.1884, Italianate and Georgian Elements; remodeled in 1912 by Architect Arthur L. Pillsbury.

Chairman Williams introduced the case. Ms. Simpson provided the staff report. She stated that staff recommends in favor of the Certificate of Appropriateness. She stated that staff could not find information about the garden shed but it is visible from the street so the COA is needed. She stated the standards are met.

Mark Kramp, 903 Durham Drive, stated that he will withdraw the request for the grant in BHP-13-16 because it is not eligible.

Ms. Graehling moved for approval of Case BHP-12-16 up to $2,500 with the garage expenses deleted from the grant; seconded by Mr. Elterich. The motion was **approved** by a vote of 6-0 with the following votes cast in favor on roll call: Ms. Graehling—yes; Mr. Elterich—yes; Mr. Sturgeon—yes; Ms. Cline—yes; Ms. Bailen—yes; Chairman Williams—yes.

BHP-13-16. Consideration, review and approval of the application submitted by Mark L Kramp requesting a Funk Grant for $158.00 to repair the water damaged garden shed for the Alvin B. Hoblit House located at 315 E Chestnut, c.1884, Italianate and Georgian Elements; remodeled in 1912 by Architect Arthur L. Pillsbury.

Chairman Williams stated BHP-14-16 was withdrawn by the petitioner. Ms. Simpson presented Mr. Kramp with the Certificate of Appropriateness.

BHP-14-16. Consideration, review and approval of the application submitted by Tim Maurer requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for front porch railings and baluster installation and painting to the Francis Funk House located at 319 E Chestnut, c.1875, Italianate variation.

Chairman Williams introduced the case. Ms. Simpson provided the staff report. She stated that staff supports both the Certificate of Appropriateness and the Funk Grant for the project. Staff asks that the paint match the exterior and the design match the renderings.

Tim Maurer, 317 E. Chestnut Street, noted that he had submitted this petition in December but withdrew it for consideration in the new fiscal year. There was a discussion about the street

number for the structure in question. Chairman Williams noted that the address may have changed over time.

Mr. Elterich asked the total amount of the work. Ms. Simpson referred to an email with the additional dollar amount. Mr. Maurer asked if they could approve the amount based on the final bid for the work.

Ms. Cline moved for approval of Case BHP-14-16 for approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness; seconded by Ms. Graehling. The motion was **approved** by a vote of 5-0-1 with the following votes cast in favor on roll call: Ms. Cline—yes; Ms. Graehling—yes; Mr. Sturgeon—yes; Mr. Elterich—yes; Ms. Bailen—yes; Chairman Williams—yes.

BHP-15-16. Consideration, review and approval of the application submitted by Tim Maurer requesting a Funk Grant for 2,500.00 for front porch railings and baluster installation and painting to the Francis Funk House located at 319 E Chestnut, c.1875, Italianate variation.

Ms. Cline moved for approval of Case BHP-14-16 up to $2,500 contingent upon receiving estimates for labor and materials, or invoice, for the work; seconded by Ms. Graehling. The motion was **approved** by a vote of 5-0-1 with the following votes cast in favor on roll call: Ms. Cline—yes; Ms. Graehling—yes; Mr. Sturgeon—yes; Mr. Elterich—yes; Ms. Bailen—yes; Chairman Williams—abstained.

Ms. Simpson provided the petitioner with the Certificate of Appropriateness.

OLD BUSINESS:
None

NEW BUSINESS:
Consideration and review of appeal letter submitted by Rick and Linda Girard for denial of Funk Grant in case BHP-05-16.

Ms. Simpson provided background on the letter and appeal request. Chairman Williams stated asphalt shingles were in wide use by 1911 and this house was built a few years later, so asphalt shingles may have been original to the structure; however, the Commission stopped funding asphalt shingles because it is more of a maintenance item. He added the Commission used to provide a $1,000 grant for asphalt shingles but it used up the grant monies available for other more critical repairs or restorations. He also noted that tile and slate roofs have been funded because they are unique to the age of the structures.

Ms. Cline stated her understanding of the grants is that they are an attempt to make up for some of the added costs associated with restoration and repair; she added she would oppose any change to that policy. Ms. Cline asked how the denial was communicated to the petitioners originally and whether a better explanation is needed explaining the philosophy behind the grant. Chairman Williams stated that without more money it would be difficult to add categories of eligibility to the grants.

There was a consensus to respond in writing to the Girards. Ms. Cline agreed to draft a letter which will be finalized by Ms. Simpson.

Ms, Graehling suggested a Pantagraph article on the purpose and rules for the grants. Chairman Williams stated there is an overall need for public education within historic districts.

Mr. Sturgeon asked about reviving the Heritage Awards for this year. There was general consensus to move ahead with this program. At the next meeting, dates and deadlines will be discussed.

Ms. Cline noted that many on the west side are unaware of the process to obtain S-4 designation, so a little education could help. Chairman Williams stated there are a lot of nice homes around Miller Park. Ms. Graehling suggested a public meeting be held to promote the program at the old court house or at the Miller Park Pavilion.

ADJOURNMENT: Mr. Elterich made a motion to adjourn; Mr. Sturgeon seconded the motion, which passed unanimously. The meeting adjourned at 6:27 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Tom Dabareiner AICP
Community Development Director