City of Bloomington Illinois

MINUTES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION - REGULAR SESSION
THURSDAY, MAY 16, 2024, 5:00 PM

The Historic Preservation Commission convened in regular session at 5:00 PM, May 16, 2024. Chair Greg Koos called the meeting to order.

Roll Call

Attendee Name	Title	Status
Paul Scharnett	Commission Vice Chair	Absent
Dawn Peters	Commissioner	Present
Sarah Lindenbaum	Commissioner	Present
John Elterich	Commissioner	Present
Emma Meyer	Commissioner	Present
Mark Adams	Commissioner	Absent
Greg Koos	Commission Chair	Present

City Staff present included Jon Branham, City Planner; Alissa Pemberton, City Planner; John Myers, Assistant City Planner; and Kelly Pfeifer, Assistant Director of Economic & Community Development.

Before Public Comment, Chair Koos stated that due to a conflict of interest, he would be recusing himself from the hearings associated with any Rust Grant funding.

Public Comment
No public comment was presented.

Consent Agenda
Items listed on the Consent Agenda are approved with one motion; Items pulled from the Consent Agenda for discussion are listed and voted on separately.

Commissioner Elterich made a motion, seconded by Commissioner Peters, to approve the consent agenda as presented.
AYES: Koos; Peters; Lindenbaum; Lindenbaum; Elterich; Meyer
Motion passed viva voce.

Item 4.A. Review and approval of the minutes of the April 18, 2024, regular meeting of the Bloomington Historic Preservation Commission.

Rust Grant FY25 Review Resources

The following item was presented:

Current Rust Grant Guidelines

Commissioner Peters expressed concerns about the number of bids per project. She noted some have one bid and others have multiple. Ms. Pemberton stated that contractors have been too busy to take on more work, noting that the City is having similar issues receiving bids for our projects as well. She discussed the issue with Administration and there will be no legal issues due to the lack of bids.

The following item was presented:

FY25 Rust Grant Application Evaluation Form

Ms. Pemberton provided a brief explanation of the scoring process, the priority rankings, and how funding is ultimately decided.

Regular Agenda

The following item was presented:

Item 5.A. **BHP-08-24** - Consideration, and action on a request submitted by David Wochner for a **Certificate of Appropriateness** for bay window repair, including salvage and replacement of existing brick façade and stone lintel, after installation of steel reinforcement, on the property at 909 N. McLean Street, PIN 21-04-207-001.

David Wochner (909 N. Mclean Street), Applicant, stated he would be available to address any issues or questions from the Commission. He described the current issues affecting the bay window, noting a crack in the stone lintel causing uneven weight distribution. Mr. Wochner stated the proposed plan would pull the stone lintel out of the façade to be repaired using an angled steel plate.

Ms. Pemberton presented the staff report with a recommendation for approval, noting that the proposal does not include mortar type and recommended a qualification that an appropriate mortar type is selected. She provided the Architectural Guidelines and comments from Vice Chair Scharnett, which noted his preference for replacement of the lintel. Ms. Pemberton stated that both proposed remedies for the lintel are permitted in the GSA technical specifications.

Commissioner Meyer inquired about the difference in the structural failure timeline between replacing the lintel and repairing the lintel. Staff stated that Vice Chair Scharnett did not provide a timeline.

Chair Koos inquired of the Applicant whether they had any comments to add following the Staff Report. The Applicant stated that he trusts the contractor and their ability to treat the stone and masonry properly. He noted his preference is to repair the stone rather than replace.

Commissioner Elterich made a motion, seconded by Commissioner Lindenbaum, to approve the scope of work and request for a Certificate of Appropriateness, as submitted by David Wochner, for bay window repair, including salvage and replacement of existing brick façade and stone lintel, after installing of steel reinforcement, on the property at 909 N. McLean Street, with the condition that either type "O", type "K" is used or the existing mortar is tested and that the steel reinforcement is galvanized.
Roll call.
AYES: Koos; Peters; Lindenbaum; Elterich; Meyer
Motion passed.

The following item was presented:

Item 5.B. **BHP-18-24 -** Consideration, and action on a request submitted by David Wochner for a **Funk Grant** in the amount of $2,725.00, for bay window repair on the property at 909 N. McLean Street, PIN 21-04-207-001.

Ms. Pemberton stated the project does meet the criteria and noted that if they choose to award the higher bid the amount would be $3,750.00.

Commissioner Peters made a motion, seconded by Commissioner Elterich, to establish findings that the project is eligible and to approve the request for a Funk Grant in the amount of up to $3,750.00 for bay window repair on the property at 909 N. McLean Street.
Roll call.
AYES: Koos; Peters; Lindenbaum; Elterich; Meyer
Motion passed.

Chair Koos appointed Commissioner Lindbaum as Acting Chair and recused himself at 5:20 PM.

The following item was presented:

Item 5.C. **BHP-02-24** Consideration, review and action on a request submitted by the McLean County Historical Society, for a **Rust Grant** in the amount of $31,500.00 for repair and/or replacement of roofing, drip edge/flashing, and gutter system on the property located at 101-103 N. Main Street (PIN: 21-04-339-034).

Ms. Pemberton presented the Staff Report, with a recommendation for approval. She stated that the building materials are not historic, because the building was rebuilt in the 1980s. However, the rebuild was within the original character of the building. The request is for repair and replacement of roofing, drip edge/flashing, and the gutter system. She stated everything proposed complies with the Architectural Guidelines. After the Staff Report, Ms. Pemberton provided Vice Chair Scharnett's comments, which included support for the project and an explanation of the potential damage if the roof is not repaired.

Russel Francois, Applicant, addressed Commissioner Peters' earlier comment regarding the lack of bids. He stated throughout the project various contractors have been brought on-site for bids, however many did not show or were unable to bid.

Commissioner Peters noted the request is inconsistent with the bids provided. Ms. Pemberton replied that it was a mistake by the Staff and that the amount requested is $31,388.00.

Mr. Francois noted that the original bids did not include the cedar shingles, which have been identified for the project. He stated the cost of materials will increase approximately 15% with the inclusion of cedar shingles.

Commissioner Peters made a motion, seconded by Commissioner Meyer, to establish findings of fact that the project is eligible and to consider funding the request by McLean County Historical Society, for a Rust Grant in the amount of up to $31,388.00 for repair and/or replacement of roofing, drip edge/flashing, and gutter system on the property located at 101-103 N. Main Street.
Roll call.
AYES: Peters; Lindenbaum; Elterich; Meyer
Motion passed.

The following item was presented:

Item 5.D. **BHP-04-24** Consideration, review and action on a request submitted by RJV Property, for a **Rust Grant** in the amount of $13,750.00 for repair and/or replacement of existing decking on the exterior rear stairs and landing, with possible structural work, and staining, on the property located at 413 N. Main Street (PIN: 21-04-189-005).

Ms. Pemberton presented the Staff Report, with a recommendation for approval. She stated the project will not affect historic materials or aspects of the building, noting no Architectural Guidelines apply. The request is to repair and replace the existing decking on the rear stair and landing, as necessary. She added the project was partially funded last year; however, the applicant did not complete the work.

Bobby Vericella, Applicant, stated the reasoning for bringing this project forward again. He noted that without the full funding, they were unable to complete the project.

Commissioner Peters noted the project will likely fall lower on the priority list due to the location of the project, non-historic elements, and contribution factors.

Commissioner Meyer made a motion, seconded by Commissioner Elterich, to establish findings that the project is eligible and to consider funding the request by RJV Property, for a Rust Grant in the amount of up to $13,750.00 for repair and/or replacement of existing decking on the exterior rear stairs and landing, with possible structure work, with staining, on the property located at 413 N. Main Street.
Roll call.
AYES: Peters; Lindenbaum; Elterich; Meyer
Motion passed.

The following item was presented:

Item 5.E. **BHP-07-24** Consideration, review and action on a request submitted by John Miller, for a **Rust Grant** in the amount of $50,000.00 for flat roof replacement, with possible structural repair, on the property located at 405 W. Washington Street (PIN: 21-04-307-004).

Ms. Pemberton presented the staff report, with a recommendation for approval. She provided a brief history of the building, noting it was a part of the original Auto Row. The request is for the replacement of the flat roof, which is currently leaking. The building is partially vacant due to the leakage. Ms. Pemberton stated that the roof is not historic, however, the repair of the roof will protect the historic façade and its elements from further damage. The Applicant is requesting the maximum amount for a major restoration project. Ms. Pemberton provided Vice Chair Scharnett's comments, which noted the one proposal to be more appropriate and provide more longevity.

Commissioner Elterich inquired of the Applicant whether the billboards are revenue-producing. The Applicant stated the billboards were revenue-producing before the COVID-19 pandemic, but since then they have lost value.

Commissioner Meyer inquired about the intended use of the building. The Applicant responded that he intends the open the building as retail space and incorporate a Route 66 Museum onto the property.

Commissioner Elterich inquired about the party wall. Mr. Miller responded inappropriate roof replacement has caused the current damage to the party wall and the other facades.

Commissioner Elterich made a motion, seconded by Commissioner Peters, to establish findings that the project is eligible and to consider funding the request by John Miller, for a Rust Grant in the amount of up to $38,425.00 for flat roof replacement, with possible structural repair, for the property located at 405 W. Washington Street.
Roll call.
AYES: Peters; Lindenbaum; Elterich; Meyer
Motion

The following item was presented:

Item 5.F. **BHP-09-24** Consideration, review and action on a request submitted by Cornerstone Living, LLC, for a **Rust Grant** in the amount of $25,410.00 for exterior tuckpointing, brick repair and replacement, and painting on the property located at 118 W. Washington Street (PIN: 21-04-338-020).

Ms. Pemberton provided the Staff Report, with a recommendation for approval, noting pertinent Architectural Guidelines for masonry repair. The request is for exterior tuckpointing, brick repair and replacement, and painting on the property. She noted the importance of types of mortar and paint. Ms. Pemberton provided Vice Chair Scharnett's comments, which noted that the paint should be carefully selected, and he will recuse himself from expressing an opinion on the project due to personal conflict.

Commissioner Peters asked for clarification on the quotes. Ms. Pemberton clarified that the amount requested is individual parts of the two quotes combined. Regarding paint stripping, she stated the masonry contractor would strip the brick, while the carpentry contractor would strip the storefront.

Commissioner Peters made a motion, seconded by Commissioner Elterich, to establish findings that the project is eligible and to consider funding the request by Cornerstone Living, LLC, for a Rust Grant in the amount of up to $18,785.00 for exterior tuckpointing, brick repair and replacement, and painting, on the property located at 118 W. Washington Street.
Roll call.
AYES: Peters; Lindenbaum; Elterich; Meyer
Motion passed.

The following item was presented:

Item 5.G. **BHP-10-24** Consideration, review and action on a request submitted by 414 N Main, LLC/RJV, for a **Rust Grant** in the amount of $25,000.00 for exterior tuckpointing, with minor brick replacement, on the property located at 309 N. Main Street (PIN: 21-04-329-001).

Mr. Myers presented the Staff Report, with a recommendation for approval, noting the building is contributing to the National Historic District and the project will affect historic materials. The request is for exterior tuckpointing, with minor brick replacement, and will be viewed by the public. Mr. Myers provided Vice Chair Scharnett's comments, which noted there may be an underlying problem with the façade and this project would be a band-aid fix. Additionally, he expressed concerns over the adequacy of the bid due to the owner self-performing the work.

Commissioner Peters expressed concern about the bids, stating she is uncomfortable awarding grant money when the only bid is from the property owner.

Commissioner Elterich asked for clarification on the ownership of the building and the scope of work. The Applicant stated he is a partial owner of the property and noted issues with the south façade.

Ms. Pemberton stated that the Commission has been approved by Administration to move forward with the bid.

Chair Lindenbaum inquired about the possibility of conducting a full exploration to see the extent of damage on the southern façade. The Applicant stated they would not consider a full evaluation at this time. He noted their focus is to repair what is necessary and do a full assessment later.

Commissioner Meyer noted concerns regarding the bid but stated she recognizes the reality of the situation and the need for repair and replacement of the façade. The Applicant added that the façade is facing constant deterioration and needs to be addressed as soon as possible.

Commissioner Elterich made a motion, seconded by Commissioner Meyer, to establish findings that the project is eligible and to consider funding the request by 414 N Main, LLC/RJV for a Rust Grant in the amount of up to $25,000.00 for exterior tuckpointing, with minor brick replacement, on the property located at 309 N. Main Street.
Roll call.
AYES: Lindenbaum; Elterich; Meyer
NAYS: Peters
Motion passed.

The following item was presented:

Item 5.H. **BHP-11-24** Consideration, review and action on a request submitted by James Sample, for a **Rust Grant** in the amount of $8,087.50 for tuckpointing and commercial alley door replacement on the property located at 525 N. Main Street (PIN: 21-04-183-004).

Mr. Myers presented the Staff Report, with a recommendation for approval, noting the building is a noncontributing structure, the materials affected are non-historic, and the affected façade would be viewed by the public. The request is for tuckpointing and commercial alley door replacement. He provided Vice Chair Scharnett's comments which noted support for the tuckpointing and expressed concern with code compliance regarding the door replacement.

The Applicant provided updated estimates.

Commissioner Peters expressed concern about only having one bid. Additionally, she stated she would like to separate the tuckpointing and door replacement during the funding discussion.

Ms. Pemberton inquired of the Applicant if the door replacement would result in a widening of the doorway. The Applicant responded that the width of the doorway would not change.

Commissioner Elterich made a motion, seconded by Commissioner Peters, to establish findings that the project is eligible and to consider funding the request by James Sample, for a Rust Grant in the amount of up to $5,033.92 for tuckpointing and commercial alley door replacement on the property located at 525 N. Main Street.
Roll call.
AYES: Peters; Lindenbaum; Elterich; Meyer
Motion passed.

The following item was presented:

Item 5.I. **BHP-12-24** Consideration, review and action on a request submitted by James Sample, for a **Rust Grant** in the amount of $4,875.00 for tuckpointing of the west elevation on the property located at 527 N. Main Street (PIN: 21-04-183-003).

Mr. Myers presented the Staff Report, with a recommendation for approval, noting the building is noncontributing, the affected materials are non-historic, and the affected façade will be viewed by the public. He provided Vice Chair Scharnett's comment which noted support for the tuckpointing.

The Applicant provided additional details about the issues facing the building, noting the issues with the bricks around the entrance.

Chair Lindenbaum identified the loose brick near the sidewalk that the Applicant was referencing on Google Maps.

Commissioner Peters expressed concern about only having one bid for the project.

> **Commissioner Elterich made a motion, seconded by Commissioner Peters, to establish findings that the project is eligible and to consider funding the request by James Sample, for a Rust Grant in the amount of up to $4,875.00 for tuckpointing of the west elevation on the property located at 527 N. Main Street. Roll call.**
> **AYES:** Peters; Lindenbaum; Elterich; Meyer
> **Motion passed.**

The following item was presented:

Item 5.J. **BHP-13-24** Consideration, review and action on a request submitted by James Sample, for a **Rust Grant** in the amount of $22,966.41 for tuckpointing, door replacement, and siding replacement on the property located at 529 N. Main Street (PIN: 21-04-183-002).

Mr. Myers presented the Staff Report, with a recommendation for approval, noting the building is contributing to the National Historic District, the affected materials are historic, and the proposed project affects the primary and secondary facades. He provided Vice Chair Scharnett's comments which noted a suggestion of using lime mortar given for the tuckpointing and replacing the wood faced with a more durable material. Additionally, he noted concerns about code compliance.

Mr. Vericella provided additional background information on the proposed project, noting the secondary façade needs the most work as it is about 75% deteriorated.

Commissioner Peters expressed concern about only having one bid for the project.

> **Commissioner Elterich made a motion, seconded by Commissioner Meyer, to establish findings that the project is eligible and to consider funding the request by James Sample, for a Rust Grant in the amount of up to $22,966.41 for tuckpointing, door replacement, and siding replacement on the property located at 529 N. Main Street.**
> **Roll call.**
> **AYES:** Peters; Lindenbaum; Elterich; Meyer
> **Motion passed.**

The following item was presented:

Item 5.K. **BHP-14-24** Consideration, review and action on a request submitted by Davin Garrett, for a **Rust Grant** in the amount of $50,000.00 for storefront replacement on the property located at 211 N. Prairie Street (PIN: 21-04-406-002).

Mr. Branham presented the Staff Report, with a recommendation for approval, noting the project will update the existing storefront following asbestos abatement and will improve accessibility. He noted pertinent Architectural Guidelines for the project. He provided Vice Chair Scharnett's comments, which noted that he must recuse himself because his firm provided the scope of work for the project.

Commissioner Peters expressed concern over the amount of the scope of work. Ms. Pemberton replied that the request referenced the submitted application amount. Mr. Branham added that the correct amount should be $20,160.75 based on the updated bids.

Commissioner Elterich made a motion, seconded by Commissioner Meyer, to establish findings that the project is eligible and to consider funding the request by Davin Garrett, for a Rust Grant in the amount of up to $20,160.75 for storefront replacement on the property located at 211 N Prairie Street.
Roll call.
AYES: Peters; Lindenbaum; Elterich; Meyer
Motion passed.

The following item was presented:

Item 5.L. **BHP-15-24** Consideration, review and action on a request submitted by 405-407 N. Main Street, LLC, for a **Rust Grant** in the amount of $22,077.00 for storefront replacement on the property located at 405 N. Main Street (PIN: 21-04-189-009).

Mr. Branham presented the Staff Report along with BHP-17-24 and provided background on the properties. He noted a discrepancy between the scope of work and the images provided by the Applicant. Ms. Pemberton provided Vice Chair Scharnett's comments, which noted potential issues with code compliance.

Chair Lindenbaum expressed concerns about the eligibility of the potential project. She stated that she is uncomfortable awarding money when there are still questions about the scope of the project.

Commissioner Meyer noted the disconnect between the pictures and the scope of work. Additionally, she stated the that it is likely that the amounts of for the proposed project are incorrect. Commissioner Peters agreed.

Mr. Vericella stated the door would not be removed and the windows were to be replaced for efficiency.

Commissioner Elterich inquired about the new cost of work. Mr. Vericella stated he could not provide the new cost at this time.

Commissioner Peters made a motion, seconded by Commissioner Meyer, that the project is not eligible for funding based on an incomplete application.
Roll call.
AYES: Peters; Lindenbaum; Elterich; Meyer
Motion passed.

The following item was presented:

Item 5.M. **BHP -16-24** Consideration, review and action on a request submitted by Green Building, LLC, for a **Rust Grant** in the amount of $17,019.00 for replacement of exterior siding on the property located at 217-221 E. Washington Street (PIN: 21-04-409-005).

Mr. Branham provided the Staff Report, with a recommendation for approval, noting the building is noncontributing and the project is impacting the primary and secondary facades. The request is for the replacement of exterior vertical siding. Mr. Branham provided Vice Chair Scharnett's comments, which noted a substitution of the material used for longevity.

Mr. Vericella provided the reasons for the chosen material. He stated longevity will not be an issue.

Commissioner Peters inquired about the reasoning behind not using wood. Mr. Vericella responded that wood requires higher maintenance than steel.

Chair Lindenbaum noted the material may be historic because it meets the 50-year requirement. She stated the Commission needs to find the balance between historic preservation and appropriate use of taxpayer funds, noting it is important to preserve historic material, however, it may be in the best interest of the taxpayers to approve a project that allows for more longevity.

Commissioner Elterich made a motion, seconded by Commissioner Meyer, to establish findings that the project is eligible and to consider funding the request by Green Building, LLC, for a Rust Grant in the amount of up to $17,019.00 for the replacement of exterior siding on the property located at 217-221 E. Washington Street.
Roll call.
AYES: Lindenbaum; Elterich; Meyer
NAYS: Peters
Motion passed.

The following item was presented:

Item 5.N. **BHP-17-24** Consideration, review and action on a request submitted by 405-407 N. Main Street, LLC, for a **Rust Grant** in the amount of $22,750.00 for storefront replacement on the property located at 407 N. Main Street (PIN: 21-04-189-008).

Mr. Branham presented the Staff Report along with BHP-15-2. He noted a discrepancy between the scope of work and the images provided. Ms. Pemberton provided Vice Chair Scharnett's comments, which noted potential issues with code compliance.

Commissioner Peters made a motion, seconded by Commissioner Meyer, that the project is not eligible for funding based on an incomplete application.
Roll call.
AYES: Peters; Lindenbaum; Elterich; Meyer
Motion passed.

<u>Historical Preservation Commission deliberation and awarding of funding amounts.</u>

Commissioner Peters made a motion, seconded by Commissioner Elterich, to move to recess for 10 minutes.
Roll call.
AYES: Peters; Lindenbaum; Elterich; Meyer
Motion passed.

The Commission reconvened at 7:37 PM, with the same quorum present.

The Commission returned to discussion of the Regular agenda items.

Ms. Pemberton provided the results of the project scoring totals, with explanations of the color coding on the spreadsheet. Staff and the Commission discussed each project based on the historic priority, visibility, whether the property has received funds in the previous years, existing property condition, impact on structural integrity, impact on the community, and overall priority ranking. The scores for each case are as follows:

- BHP-02-24, 101 N Main St – 17.75
- BHP-04-24, 413 N Main St – 11.5
- BHP-07-24, 405 W Washington St – 17.25
- BHP-09-24, 118 W Washington St – 17
- BHP-10-24, 309 N Main St – 16.5
- BHP-11-24, 525 N Main St – 14
- BHP-12-24, 527 N Main St – 14.75
- BHP-13-24, 529 N Main St – 17.75
- BHP-14-24, 211 N Prairie St – 14.6667
- BHP-15-24, 405 N Main St – 13
- BHP-16-24, 219 E Washington St – 10
- BHP-17-24, 407 N Main St – 12

The Commission discussed funding certain projects partially to allow the award of some funding to more projects. They asked Staff for clarification that even with partial funding the Applicant will still have to meet the conditions set forth. Ms. Pemberton confirmed. The Commission continued to discuss balancing the project and funding to ensure that the most necessary project received funding.

The Commission decision on awarded funding is as follows:

- BHP-02-24, 101 N Main St, Commission decided to allocate $31,388.00.
- BHP-04-24, 413 N Main St, Commission decided to not fund this project.

- BHP-07-24, 405 W Washington St, Commission decided to allocate $38,425.00.
- BHP-09-24, 118 W Washington St, Commission decided to allocate $18,785.00.
- BHP-10-24, 309 N Main St, Commission decided to allocate $19,191.20.
- BHP-11-24, 525 N Main St, Commission decided to allocate $2,596.39.
- BHP-12-24, 527 N Main St, Commission decided to allocate $4,875.00.
- BHP-13-24, 529 N Main St, Commission decided to allocate $9,739.41.
- BHP-14-24, 211 N Prairie St, Commission decided to not fund this project.
- BHP-15-24, 405 N Main St, Commission decided to not fund this project.
- BHP-16-24, 219 E Washington St, Commission decided to not fund this project.
- BHP-17-24, 407 N Main St, Commission decided to not fund this project.

Ms. Pemberton adjusted the totals on the spreadsheet, attached as Exhibit "B", and asked for verification that the Commission believes the funding listed is correct and appropriate. The Commission confirmed.

Commissioner Meyer made a motion, seconded by Commissioner Elterich, to award the subject projects, with exception to BHP-10-24, as discussed and listed above, which totals to $105,808.80.
Roll call.
AYES: Peters; Meyer; Lindenbaum; Elterich
Motion Passed.

Commissioner Meyer made a motion, seconded by Commissioner Elterich, to award the remaining $19,191.80 to BHP-10-24 for tuckpointing with the condition that the Applicant provides a more solidified scope of work and a second bid from a third party.
Roll call.
AYES: Peters; Meyer; Lindenbaum; Elterich
Motion Passed.

New Business

6.A. CLG Grant Update

Mr. Myers said the new Certified Local Government (CLG) Grant application and information will be published soon. He asked the Commission to think about potential uses of the funds.

6.B. Next Meeting Agenda Item

Commissioner Peters asked Staff to add a Rust Grant discussion to the next agenda to identify issues and solutions for reoccurring problems.

Adjournment

Commissioner Peters made a motion, seconded by Commissioner Elterich, to adjourn the meeting.

AYES: Peters; Lindenbaum; Elterich; Meyer
Motion passed viva voce.

The Meeting Adjourned at 8:33PM.

CITY OF BLOOMINGTON

Sarah Lindenbaum
Sarah Lindenbaum, Acting Chair

Alissa Pemberton
Alissa Pemberton, Staff Liaison